

## “Anecdotal Records As Instrument For *Qirā’ah* Skills And Cognitive Development Of Students’:

A Study at the State Islamic University of Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Fifth Semester.”

Muhammad Hamdani, Mukmin Ridoan Simamora,

UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta

Email: [hamdanisalat77@gmail.com](mailto:hamdanisalat77@gmail.com), [MUKMINRidoar2001.sra@gmail.com](mailto:MUKMINRidoar2001.sra@gmail.com)

Naskah Diterima Tanggal 27/12/2025; Direvisi Akhir Tanggal 19/01/2026; Disetujui Tanggal 26/01/2026

DOI: 10.37216/lughatuad-dhat.v6i2.3102.

### Abstrack

Non-test assessments play an important role, especially in assessing students' cognitive abilities in reading skills. One non-test instrument that can be used is anecdotal records, which document students' authentic development based on systematic observation. This study adopted a qualitative method with a case study approach, focusing on observing cognitive aspects such as recognizing information, comprehending reading content, analyzing, evaluating, and synthesizing. The results of the study indicate that the use of anecdotal records by teachers in the observation process is still restricted to behavior that is observable in the classroom and school environment. However, students' cognitive abilities in reading have demonstrated progressive improvement in accordance with their grade level, as evidenced by teachers' reports and reflections on the learning process that has been implemented.

**Keywords:** Anecdotal Notes, *Maharah Qiro'ah*, Assessment Instruments

### Abstrack

Penilaian non-tes memiliki peran penting, khususnya dalam menilai kemampuan kognitif siswa dalam keterampilan membaca. Salah satu instrumen non-tes yang dapat dimanfaatkan adalah catatan anekdot (anecdotal record), yang merekam perkembangan siswa secara alami berdasarkan observasi. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode kualitatif dengan pendekatan studi kasus, yang difokuskan pada pengamatan aspek-aspek kognitif seperti mengenali informasi (recognizing),

memahami isi bacaan (comprehending), menganalisis (analyzing), mengevaluasi (evaluating), dan menyintesis (synthesizing). Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa penggunaan catatan anekdot oleh guru dalam proses observasi masih terbatas pada perilaku yang tampak di kelas maupun lingkungan sekolah. Namun, kemampuan kognitif siswa dalam membaca mengalami peningkatan secara bertahap sesuai jenjang kelas, didukung oleh laporan dan refleksi guru atas proses pembelajaran yang berlangsung.

**Kata Kunci:** Catatan Anekdote, *Maharah Qiro'ah*, Instrumen Penilaian

## Introduction

*Enhancing and fostering* reading skills in students is essential to support their overall development. Effective reading skills are a fundamental basis for learning, as they are closely associated with understanding, analyzing, and processing information from various sources. This competency falls within the cognitive domain, which plays an important role in achieving educational success, as articulated by Popham (1995). To optimize learning outcomes, it is essential to implement appropriate assessment strategies to students' reading skills<sup>1</sup>.

Educational institutions need to design assessment systems that are relevant and in line with reading competencies, so that learning objectives can be achieved optimally. Special attention should be given to the development of reading skills assessment, particularly in the context of *Maharah Qiro'ah*. In Arabic language learning, especially in reading skills (*maharah qirā'ah*), the cognitive domain needs serious attention. Educators should pay attention to the development of students' thinking skills in understanding, identifying, and analyzing Arabic reading texts. One way teachers can show their attention to students' cognitive progress is through systematic assessment or evaluation of their reading skills. In addition, the process of assessing reading ability cannot always be done instantly, because reading comprehension develops over time and with practice. It is precisely this gradual change in reading comprehension that is the main goal of education. Therefore, cognitive evaluation in *maharah qirā'ah* can be carried out continuously as long as it shows progress in line with learning objectives.

---

<sup>1</sup> W. James Popham, *Classroom Assessment, What Teachers Need It Know* (Boston: Pergamon Press, 1995).

Assessment is an important element in the learning process that serves to measure the achievement of student competencies, as well as a tool to evaluate the effectiveness of the teaching methods used. Assessment is a crucial component in organizational management that serves to assess, analyze, and improve the performance of individuals and the organization as a whole. In both the business and public sectors, performance evaluation is used as a tool to assess the effectiveness of human resources<sup>2</sup>. In the context of Arabic language learning, reading skills or maharah kalam are one of the fundamental aspects that need to be assessed effectively. Maharah Kalam not only includes the ability to understand information that is heard, but also involves active responses to the messages conveyed. Therefore, it is important to develop assessment instruments that not only measure cognitive abilities but also support the mastery of skills in an applicable and sustainable manner<sup>3</sup>. Through this assessment, it can be determined to what extent students have mastered the competencies or material taught by teachers. Assessment is a continuation of measurement, aiming to give meaning to numbers as a value. This process is carried out through various methods, such as performance assessments, attitude assessments, written assessments, projects, collections of student work, and self-assessments. The evaluation of learning outcomes, both formal and informal, should be carried out in a pleasant atmosphere to give students the opportunity to demonstrate their understanding and skills<sup>4</sup>.

Assessment is a systematic process that involves collecting information in the form of numerical data or verbal descriptions, followed by evaluation and interpretation to support decision-making. According to Sahidihardjo, the principle of assessment emphasizes that in its implementation, students are expected to demonstrate, show, and understand their knowledge, provided that this is done in accordance with the assessment procedures set by the teacher<sup>5</sup>. In the context of education, assessment refers to the effort to measure the extent to which learning objectives have been achieved. According to the 2013 Curriculum Guidebook, skills assessment

---

<sup>2</sup> Penilaian Kinerja, Dan Metode, and Penilaian Kinerja, "JURNAL EKONOMI , MANAJEMEN , BISNIS DAN SOSIAL Penilaian Kinerja Dan Metode Penilaian Kinerja" 5 (2025): 149–53.

<sup>3</sup> Desi Sukenti, *Buku Ajar Penilaian Pembelajaran Dalam Bahasa Indonesia* (Sumatra Barat: Mitra Cendekia Media, 2021).

<sup>4</sup> Abdul Qodir, *Evaluasi Dan Penilaian Pembelajaran* (Yogyakarta: K-Media, 2017).

<sup>5</sup> Rahmawati Sunarti, *Penilaian Dalam Kurikulum 2013 Membantu Guru Dan Calon Guru Mengetahui Langkah-Langkah Penilaian Pembelajaran* (Yogyakarta: CV ANDI OFFSET, 2014).

clearly includes assigning students to compile reports and present their results, which is categorized as psychomotor assessment in the form of projects<sup>6</sup>.

One method that can be used to comprehensively assess students' listening skills is through anecdotal records. Anecdotal records are records used to evaluate the quality of evidence from observations. In the process of recording anecdotes, teachers need to pay close attention to students' progress as a form of monitoring. The results of these observations are then documented in special records<sup>7</sup>. In this context, observations focus on the development of students' affective abilities. Anecdotal notes are brief notes that record the behavior, responses, or abilities of students in specific learning situations. Anecdotal notes are one of the non-test assessment instruments that play an important role, especially in assessing practical aspects whose changes cannot be measured quantitatively. This assessment requires in-depth observation to evaluate the extent to which maharah istima' learning influences the development of students' Arabic language skills. As a form of observation-based assessment, non-test assessments are generally used to measure students' affective aspects and soft skills<sup>8</sup>. This instrument provides a more in-depth picture of students' listening skills, especially in observing affective aspects such as interest, attention, and active participation during the learning process.

Of course, non-test assessments such as anecdotal notes play an important role for teachers in understanding the development of students' abilities. Through this process, assessment becomes more effective because anecdotal notes allow teachers to make in-depth observations, so that student development can be assessed more accurately. Based on this description, the researcher was interested in exploring the use of anecdotal notes as an assessment tool in maharah istima' to develop students' Arabic language skills, while also observing changes in the assessment practices carried out by teachers. Therefore, this study is titled "Anecdotal Notes Assessment as an

---

<sup>6</sup> Irfan Efendi, Melisa Prawitasari, and Heri Susanto, "Implementasi Penilaian Pembelajaran Pada Kurikulum 2013 Mata Pelajaran Sejarah," *Prabayaksa: Journal of History Education* 1, no. 1 (2021): 21, <https://doi.org/10.20527/prb.v1i1.3081>.

<sup>7</sup> Nora Ramos-Vallecillo, Víctor Murillo-Ligorred, and Raquel Lozano-Blasco, "University Students' Achievement of Meaningful Learning through Participation in Thinking Routines," *European Journal of Investigation in Health, Psychology and Education* 14, no. 4 (2024): 1012–27, <https://doi.org/10.3390/ejihpe14040066>.

<sup>8</sup> Resti Septikasari et al., "11 Teknik Penilaian Tes Dan Non Tes (Resti Septikasari,Dkk) | 761 Madani," *Jurnal Ilmiah Multidisiplin* 1, no. 11 (2023): 761–64, <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.10388284>.

Assessment Instrument for Maharah Istima' on the Abilities of Students at the State Islamic University of Yogyakarta.” The main focus of this study is to analyze the implementation of anecdotal notes by teachers in the assessment of maharah istima' at the State Islamic University of Yogyakarta and to see its impact on the development of students' listening skills.

## Research Method

The research design adopted in this study is qualitative research with a case study approach. Qualitative research was a research approach that investigates phenomena and its processes, where the data collected is in the form of information such as biographical history and other matters related to the research other relevant aspects.<sup>9</sup> Qualitative research is sometimes defined as research that will produces descriptive research data or data in the textual form, which consisting of verbal expressions taken from the statements of individuals who *serve as informants*.<sup>10</sup>

In summary , a case study is a study in which researchers *investigate* a particular case or phenomenon *within a particular context* and collect *comprehensive* and in-depth information using data collection procedures.<sup>11</sup> The case study approach is widely adopted in qualitative research, as Patton *contends* that the analytical depth of qualitative research *is derived from* case studies.<sup>12</sup> In this study, a case study was undertaken at Sunan Kalijaga Islamic University in Yogyakarta. The participants in this study consisted of Master's students studying Arabic Language Education (PBA) and fifth-semester undergraduate students at Sunan Kalijaga Islamic University in Yogyakarta. Three data collection techniques were employed in this study, namely observation, interviews, and document analysis. Data analysis was conducted using the Miles and Huberman model, which consists of: Data Reduction, where the researcher condenses the interview results and filters irrelevant data the data; Data Presentation, where the researcher presents the data with clear and interesting systematic and coherent descriptions; and are formulated/Verifying

---

<sup>9</sup> R. Pohan, *Metodologi Penelitian Pendidikan* (yogyakarta: Lanarka Publisher, 2007).

<sup>10</sup> Lexi Moleong. J, *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif* (Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2019).

<sup>11</sup> J. W. Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Tradition*. (Sage publications., 1998).

<sup>12</sup> M. Q. Patton, *How to Use Qualitative Methods in Evaluation* (Sage Publications, 1991).

Conclusions, where conclusions are drawn that answer address the research questions that were formulated at the initial stage.<sup>13</sup>

This study employs aspects of affective domain assessment as *assessment indicators* to illustrate the importance of anecdotal records in the assessment of affective learning outcomes. These *affective dimensions* include receiving, responding, valuing, organizing, and characterization by a value or value complex. These five hierarchical categories constitute the affective as proposed by (taxonomy levels) by Krathwohl, Bloom, and Masia (1964)<sup>14</sup>.

**Table 1. Assessment Instruments for Cognitive Aspects in Arabic Reading Skills Courses**

Cognitive Aspects	Learning Indicators	Demonstrated Abilities
Remembering	Students can recognize and remember vocabulary (mufradat) that has been learned in the reading text.	Students state the meaning of words, synonyms, antonyms, or plural/singular forms of words in the text.
Understanding	Students can understand the content of Arabic texts.	Students answer questions based on the content of the text, summarize the main ideas of the paragraphs, or explain the meaning of sentences.
Implementing	Students are able to use information from the text to answer questions or compose new sentences.	Students use the same sentence structure to create their own sentences, or apply vocabulary in other contexts.

<sup>13</sup> A. M. Milles, M. B., & Huberman, *Qualitative Data Analysis, A Methods Sourceboo (R. Tjeptjep, Trans.; 3rd Ed.)* (2014: Sage publications., n.d.).

<sup>14</sup> & Masia. Krathwohl, Bloom, *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives Book 2 Affective Domain* (New York: David McKay Company, Inc, 1964).

Analyzing	Students are able to analyze the structure of texts and the hidden meanings in reading materials.	Students distinguish between main and supporting sentences, identify language styles, or demonstrate relationships between sentences/paragraphs.
Evaluating	Students can assess the truthfulness of the text content and the validity of the arguments in the reading.	Students give their opinions on the content of the text, compare it with other texts, or critique the opinions in the reading.
Creating	Students are able to compose texts or summaries based on texts they have read.	Students summarize the content of the text and write responses or short stories based on the reading topic.

## Results and Discussion

Sunan Kalijaga Islamic University Yogyakarta uses various assessment instruments in cognitive assessment of students, ranging from observation sheets, self-assessment, and others. However, in this study, the researcher will focus more on the assessment instrument in the form of anecdotal notes made by field study students of the Arabic Language Education Master's Program at UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta.

In its application at Sunan Kalijaga Islamic University in Yogyakarta, teachers design assessment rubrics in the form of anecdotal notes; this is intended to ensure that teachers do not overlook aspects to be observed in students<sup>15</sup>. This means that in this case, Maharatul Qiro'ah teachers at Sunan Kalijaga Islamic University in Yogyakarta carry out the assessment process using anecdotal

<sup>15</sup> Wawancara Mahasiswa Field Study Magister Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Uin Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Mei 2025.

notes that have systematically compiled a series of aspects of their students' cognitive assessment. Then, they only need to conduct observations in accordance with the items of cognitive assessment to be assessed.

### 1. Remembering (تذكر)

In teaching Maharatul Qirā'ah, lecturers strive to ensure that students are able to remember the vocabulary and sentence structures they have learned as a basis for understanding the readings. Lecturers emphasize the importance of memorization as a first step in reading skills. This was conveyed by one of the Arabic lecturers at UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta as follows:

In Maharatul Qirā'ah classes, I focus on helping students, especially those in their fifth semester, to remember the vocabulary and sentence patterns that have been taught previously. This is because I believe that memory is the key foundation for understanding Arabic texts. Without a good memory, students will find it difficult to grasp the meaning of the texts they read<sup>16</sup>.”

Furthermore, when researchers tried to interview fifth-semester students at UIN Sunan Kalijaga, they also admitted the same thing, that sometimes they did not pay attention to the material being taught in Maharatul Qirā'ah lessons. Regarding the reasons why they did not pay attention, the answers given varied, but most of the reasons stemmed from a lack of memorization or vocabulary mastery<sup>17</sup>.

### 2. Understanding (فهم)

Applied learning will certainly encourage students to try to apply the material they have learned in real life or in an academic context. In Maharatul Qirā'ah learning, lecturers have attempted to present material that is not only theoretical but can also be practiced

---

<sup>16</sup> ibid

<sup>17</sup> Wawancara Mahasiswa Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Uin Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Mei 2025.

directly. However, the reality in the field shows that not all fifth-semester students are able to apply this material to the fullest extent.

I have tried to make Maharatul Qirā'ah lessons more practical by providing exercises in reading texts, understanding context, and topics that are considered current. However, there are still many fifth-semester students who find it difficult to understand. They tend to just memorize without really understanding how the text can be used in conversation or broader studies <sup>18</sup>.”

Similar statements were also made by several fifth-semester students at UIN Sunan Kalijaga. They admitted that even though they understood the theory and structure of reading, they still had difficulty applying it in practice, whether in discussions, presentations, or in the context of independent reading.

### 3. Implementing (تطبيق)

Students who are able to apply what they have learned are usually those who not only understand the theory, but also pay close attention to Mahārah Qirā'ah lessons, and then try to use these skills in a broader context, such as reading authentic texts, analyzing meaning, or relating the content of the reading to real life. This application is, of course, only carried out by students who have been actively involved in learning from the beginning. In fact, it is not uncommon for the application skills demonstrated by one student to spark further discussion among other students, including those who previously appeared passive in class, especially if the student's interpretation or understanding differs from that of their peers<sup>19</sup>.

When students really pay attention and are active in learning, they will begin to apply their reading skills by analyzing the content of the text, interpreting specific meanings, and relating them to the reality they understand. For example, there are students who say, ‘So the meaning of this text is about social responsibility, right, sir?’ or ‘In that

---

<sup>18</sup> Wawancara Mahasiswa Field Study Magister Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Uin Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Mei 2025.

<sup>19</sup> Observasi pembelajaran Maharah Qiroah UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Mei 2025.

case, the meaning of this sentence can be linked to the current state of society.’ Such sentences often trigger responses from other students who were previously silent, and they begin to join the discussion. When they are able to apply their reading skills in a broader context like this, I feel that the Mahārah Qirā’ah learning process has been successful<sup>20</sup>.

However, when researchers tried to ask several fifth-semester students directly about how they applied Mahārah Qirā’ah, some of them stated that the application often occurred spontaneously and they did not realize it as a form of application. Therefore, the researchers did not continue the interview further on this aspect, because the application process was more natural and developed through their habits in understanding and processing reading texts.

#### 4. Analyzing (تحليل)

In developing the ability to analyze reading texts in the Maharah Qira'ah course, lecturers note that assessments of student comprehension are often subjective. This is because lecturers can only evaluate the extent to which students are able to describe the content of the text and convey critical responses during the learning process in the classroom. Lecturers cannot directly observe how students apply these analytical skills outside the classroom, such as in scientific discussions or scientific writing. In addition, lecturers also realize that not all elements of analysis can be seen from assignments or presentations, because there are aspects of critical thinking that are not fully explicitly described. Lecturers explain:

*Students can demonstrate their analytical skills through their responses to readings, whether in the form of summaries, identification of main ideas, or evaluation of text content. These skills are sometimes evident when they express their opinions in discussions or write analytical papers. However, not all students are able to consistently display these skills outside of formal assignments. For this reason, I always emphasize the importance of critical thinking in every learning session. Unfortunately, the application of analytical skills outside the classroom, such as in independent research, cannot be fully*

---

<sup>20</sup> Wawancara Mahasiswa Field Study Magister Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Uin Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Mei 2025.

*observed by me. Therefore, guidance at the research level is still needed by academic advisors.*<sup>21</sup>."

Furthermore, researchers are interested in examining whether there are aspects of students' analytical thinking that are not captured through formal assessment, and how this affects the development of students' higher-order thinking skills.

*Our assessment is based on classroom activities, written assignments, and presentations. We communicate all evaluation results to students as material for improvement. I always provide notes on parts of the analysis that are not sharp enough or arguments that are not strong enough. After providing feedback, I see an improvement in the quality of students' thinking in constructing arguments and expressing opinions. Assessing analytical skills is very important, especially in supporting their readiness to write proposals or theses in the following semester*<sup>22</sup>.

In this case, the use of instruments such as anecdotal observation notes is considered more effective for recording the development of students' analytical thinking in detail and contextually.

## 5. Creating (إبداع)

When students are characterized by their ability to create (إبداع) based on the texts they study in the Maharah Qirā'ah course, it is evident how the learning outcomes are integrated into their creative assignments, becoming part of their thinking style and means of expression. However, this raises the question: How do lecturers assess whether the creativity produced by students is truly an application of the material that has been taught? How do they know that the reading process has influenced students' creativity and originality? In an interview with a Maharah Qirā'ah lecturer at a university in Yogyakarta, he explained:

*As I mentioned earlier, in the assessment process, we can only evaluate students' work based on what they present in class, such as paraphrased texts, creative reviews, or reading interpretations. Creativity outside of class—for example, whether they write*

---

<sup>21</sup> ibid

<sup>22</sup> ibid

*Arabic essays independently, compose poetry, or express other original ideas—cannot be directly monitored by us. It is the students' responsibility to continue developing their skills independently outside of class time*<sup>23</sup>.

When researchers interviewed several fifth-semester students about the creative process in Maharah Qirā'ah, their responses showed that only some of them actively developed their ability to transform reading texts into original Arabic works. Different reading materials can provide different inspiration for each student. Student A, for example, is known for being able to rewrite the content of the reading material in the form of short stories in Arabic, while Student B is known to be more adept at composing poetry inspired by the values in the text. However, Student B does not demonstrate the same narrative skills as Student A, and conversely, Student A does not excel in poetic works like Student B.

### Conclusion

This study finds that anecdotal records constitute a effective non-test assessment instrument for assessing students' cognitive development in Qirā'ah (Arabic reading) skills. Through ongoing and naturalistic observation, anecdotal records *facilitate* instructors to document students' cognitive processes, including remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating, and constructing meaning from Arabic reading texts.

The findings indicate that the current implementation of anecdotal records is primarily restricted to observable behaviors within classroom and institutional settings. Despite this limitation, the instrument offers substantive insights into students' progressive cognitive progression across academic levels. Furthermore, instructors' reflective notes derived from anecdotal observations contribute to informed pedagogical decision-making and instructional adjustments in the teaching of Qirā'ah.

---

<sup>23</sup> *ibid*

Overall, anecdotal records function not only as an evaluative tool but also as a reflective mechanism that supports a more holistic understanding of students' cognitive growth in reading comprehension. Therefore, this study recommends the systematic integration of anecdotal records with clearly defined cognitive indicators to strengthen the validity and comprehensiveness of non-test assessments in Arabic language instruction. Such integration may strengthen continuous assessment practices and support sustainable cognitive development in higher education contexts.

## REFERENCES

- Arum, A. E., Khumaedi, M., & Susilaningih, E. (2022). Pengembangan Instrumen Penilaian Domain Afektif (Sikap) Kepercayaan Diri pada Siswa. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 6(3), 5467–5474.
- Asif, T., Guangming, O., Haider, M. A., Colomer, J., Kayani, S., & ul Amin, N. (2020). Moral education for sustainable development: Comparison of university teachers' perceptions in China and Pakistan. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 12(7). Scopus. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12073014>
- Bloom, B. S. (1956). *Taxonomy of educational objectives: The classification of educational goals. Handbook I: Cognitive domain*. New York, NY: Longman.
- Brown, H. D. (2004). *Language assessment: Principles and classroom practices*. White Plains, NY: Pearson Education.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.
- Fajriyah, R. Z., Maemonah, M., & Maryamah, M. (2021). Teori Humanistik Kebutuhan Maslow dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Sekolah Dasar (Analisis Artikel Jurnal Sinta 2-6). *JHIP-Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan*, 4(8), 893–898
- Krathwohl, D. R., Bloom, B. S., & Masia, B. B. (1964). *Taxonomy of educational objectives: Handbook II: Affective domain*. New York, NY: David McKay Company.
- Lexy, J. M. (2005). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Remaja Rosdakarya.

Magdalena, I., Sholikha, S., Azis, V. I. N., & Fahtoni, A. (2024). Menganalisis Alat Penilaian Hasil Belajar dalam Evaluasi Pembelajaran. *Sindoro: Cendikia Pendidikan*, 2(11), 11–20.

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.

Nitko, A. J., & Brookhart, S. M. (2011). *Educational assessment of students* (6th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson Education.

Popham, W. J. (1995). *Classroom assessment: What teachers need to know*. Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.

Richards, J. C., & Schmidt, R. (2010). *Longman dictionary of language teaching and applied linguistics* (4th ed.). London: Pearson Longman.

, R. J. (2005). *Student-involved assessment for learning* (4th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Sugiyono. (2019). *Metode penelitian kualitatif, kuantitatif, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.